



PBR HAWAII
 & ASSOCIATES, INC.

MEETING NOTES

MEETING DATE: August 14, 2024

PRESENT:

Project Team:

1. Lillie Makaila, DHHL
2. Julie-Ann Cachola, DHHL
3. Ku‘upuamae‘ole Kiyuna, DHHL
4. ‘Olana Chow, DHHL
5. Catie Cullison, PBR HAWAII
6. Nathalie Razo, PBR HAWAII
7. Makena Bassett, PBR HAWAII

Beneficiaries/ Community Members:

TOTAL ATTENDEES:	34
Total Beneficiaries:	28
Applicants:	7
Lessees:	20
Both:	1
Others:	6

SUBJECT: Department of Hawaiian Home Lands Hawai‘i Island Plan Update Beneficiary Meeting, Round 1

ATTACHMENTS: A) PowerPoint Presentation, B) Land Use Designation Updated Maps, C) Fact Sheets, D) Comment Cards

1. Meeting Overview and Highlights

This meeting was the first of three rounds of meetings to discuss and receive feedback from DHHL beneficiaries on updated land designations for the Hawai‘i Island Plan Update. The purpose of this meeting was to educate the beneficiaries on the current Hawai‘i Island Plan and receive input on proposed Land Use Designations for the Hawai‘i Island Plan Update.

Tables were set up around the room with copies of initial drafts of the Proposed Land Use Designation Maps (Attachment B) and Fact Sheets (Attachment C) for each tract. As meeting attendees arrived they were asked to sign in and were given comment cards (Attachment D) for attendee review and use during the rest of the meeting. The comment cards listed each tract of DHHL land and included space for beneficiaries to leave their input about the proposed land use designations. During sign in, attendees were encouraged to

R. STAN DUNCAN, ASLA
President / Chairman

RUSSELL Y. J. CHUNG, FASLA
Executive Vice-President / Principal

VINCENT SHIGEKUNI
Senior Vice-President / Principal

GRANT T. MURAKAMI, AICP, LEED® AP BD+C
Senior Vice-President / Principal

KIMI MIKAMI YUEN, LEED® AP BD+C
Vice-President / Principal

CATIE CULLISON, AICP
Vice-President / Principal

TOM SCHNELL, AICP
Vice-President / Principal

MARC SHIMATSU, ASLA
Principal

RAYMOND T. HIGA, ASLA
Associate Principal

DACHENG DONG, LEED® AP
Associate Principal

NATHALIE RAZO
Associate Principal

ANN MIKIKO BOUSLOG, PhD
Director of Land Economics & Real Estate

RAMSAY R. M. TAUM
Cultural Sustainability Planner

ETSUYO KILA
Senior Associate

GREG NAKAI
Senior Associate

NICOLE SWANSON, ASLA
Associate

BRADLEY FURUYA, AICP
Associate

C.R. ‘IMIPONO WICHMAN
Associate

THOMAS S. WITTEN, FASLA
Chairman Emeritus

W. FRANK BRANDT, FASLA
Founding Partner

1001 Bishop Street, Suite 650
 Honolulu, Hawai‘i 96813-3484
 Tel: (808) 521-5631
 Fax: (808) 523-1402
 E-mail: sysadmin@pbrhawaii.com

printed on recycled paper

MEETING MINUTES

SUBJECT: Department of Hawaiian Homelands Hawai‘i Island Plan Update Beneficiary Meeting, Round 1 – Kohala and Hāmākua
August 14, 2024
Page 2

visit the tables prior to the start of the formal presentation. Sticky notes were also provided for beneficiaries to leave comments on said documents

Lilliane Makaila of DHHL led the presentation (Attachment A) and meeting. She began the presentation with a review of the meeting agenda, as well as the overview and approach for the Hawai‘i Island Plan Update, giving background information on the original Hawai‘i Island Plan and the purpose/process of the Plan Update, and introducing the timeline of the project. Lilliane followed this with an emphasis on the incorporation of beneficiary knowledge in the Plan Update, and gave a brief explanation of the updated Land Use Designations generated from the 2022 Department of Hawaiian Home Lands General Plan Update. The presentation included a brief description outlining each of the Land Use Designations and for what they are used.

Following this, she went over each DHHL tract in Kohala, Hāmākua, and the ‘Āina Mauna Legacy Lands, and compared the 2002 Hawai‘i Island Plan Land Use Designation¹ to the proposed Land Use Designations identified. She went through each tract before opening the presentation to comments and input. There were some beneficiary questions during the presentation as well.

Following the conclusion of the presentation, beneficiaries were asked to participate and provide feedback. Beneficiaries could participate by raising their hands to provide oral comment and/or walk around the room to review the maps and leave comments on their comment cards, sticky notes, or discuss their input with the project team. Oral comments brought up during the Q&A period were recorded by PBR HAWAII and is summarized below. A more detailed account of beneficiary oral comments can be found in Section 5.

The meeting closed when beneficiaries had no further comments or input to share with the project team.

The following key topics were identified in oral comments:

- Understanding local conditions and incorporating diverse perspectives; Address land upkeep issues and historical land use to improve stewardship.
- Clarifying timing and impact of new designations on current waitlists; Provide clear timelines and manage expectations regarding land designations and awarding processes.
- Improving communication and accountability of DHHL’s updates and progress reports; Enhance transparency and regular updates on land use and leasing status.
- Expediting the lot awarding process; Streamline procedures to reduce wait times and increase efficiency in land allocation.
- Beneficiary engagement improvements; Tailor outreach to better involve beneficiaries and address their feedback on land use and maintenance.

¹ Note: The 2002 Hawai‘i Island Plan is the main source for identified land use designations; however, some tracts are more recent acquisitions or were subject to planning efforts more recently than 2002, in those instances the most recent reference was utilized.

MEETING MINUTES

SUBJECT: Department of Hawaiian Homelands Hawai'i Island Plan Update Beneficiary

Meeting, Round 1 – Kohala and Hāmākua

August 14, 2024

Page 3

- Support for land management and development initiatives; Explore the benefits of new projects like geothermal energy and address environmental and land management issues.

2. Comment Card Comments

- a. We received 4 comment cards from beneficiaries with comments and questions regarding the proposed Land Use Designations, development, tracts, and preferred priorities. These comments will be available for review along with the comments from the online comment form.

3. Fact Sheet Comments

- a. We received no comments on the Fact Sheets.

4. Large Map Sticky Note Comments

- a. We received comments on 8 Large Maps with comments and questions about environmental conditions of tracts, Land Use Designation suggestions, status of projects, map critiques, and expressing priority for projects. These comments will be available for review along with the comments from the online comment form.

5. Beneficiary Question and Answer Input

a. Comment During the Presentation:

1. **First Commenter:** Asked if there were any open leases and expressed frustration with the lack of clarity on DHHL's direction and issues with the succession rule. They were also interested in understanding how to earn value from the lands and discussed the potential for buying or selling DHHL leases. DHHL responded that unhatched lands are not yet ready for awarding due to infrastructure and designation issues but did not address the broader concerns or potential for selling/purchasing leases.
2. **Second Commenter:** Inquired about current residential lots in Pu'ukapu that are falling into disrepair. DHHL acknowledged the problem and noted that a maintenance team from O'ahu could potentially be sent to the Big Island. They suggested a follow-up discussion after the meeting for further details.
3. **Third Commenter:** Wanted to know their status given their homes are in the Blue special district on the Kawaihae map. DHHL offered to discuss this further after the meeting and mentioned the possibility of changing their designation.
4. **Fourth Commenter:** Asked for clarification on what "unhatched lands" means. DHHL explained that this term refers to land leases that may become available in the future, with leases potentially ending within 20 years.

b. Q&A/Group Comment Period:

1. Raised concerns about a specific tract of land that was not included in the map presented during the meeting, and the commenter sought clarification on why this land was omitted. It was noted by DHHL that the exact reason for the omission was not immediately known, but efforts would be made to investigate the issue. The department promised to provide a detailed

MEETING MINUTES

SUBJECT: Department of Hawaiian Homelands Hawai'i Island Plan Update Beneficiary

Meeting, Round 1 – Kohala and Hāmākua

August 14, 2024

Page 4

explanation in the next round of meetings to address this oversight and clarify the land's status.

2. Expressed gratitude for the presentation and saw it as an important opportunity for beneficiaries to influence land designations by voicing their preferences. They asked how long it would take to finalize and implement the proposed land designations and hoped that the feedback from beneficiaries would be incorporated into the decision-making process. It was explained by DHHL that the Land Development Division (LDD) is responsible for determining the timelines for finalizing and implementing land designations. Emphasis was placed on the importance of submitting comments to help prioritize projects effectively. Beneficiaries were encouraged to provide their feedback to guide and expedite the planning process.
3. Highlighted the urgent need to prioritize kanaka maoli interests, expressing frustration with the proposed 20-year timeline for land use and development. They were concerned that many beneficiaries might not live to see the benefits if the process took as long as suggested. It was clarified that while some projects could indeed take up to 20 years, many projects could be completed much sooner, possibly within 3 years, depending on the specifics of the plan and the decisions made by the commissioners and council. The Big Island has sufficient land, but effective designation and utilization are crucial challenges that need to be addressed more promptly.
4. Beneficiary stated that allocating land to beneficiaries should be mandated due to the significant waiting period and the need to address the urgency of getting people on the land. They stressed that DHHL should move forward with its plans to address these needs more immediately. They emphasized the need for immediate action to address the waiting lists and expedite the land allocation process.
5. Commenter shared their personal experience of joining the waitlist for a land award in 1960 and waiting approximately 40 years to receive an award. They mentioned that their granddaughter's inventory revealed numerous vacant lands and expressed frustration with individuals selling their leases and the poor upkeep of land, particularly in Pu'ukapu, where poor environmental conditions had resulted in their horse's death. The commenter also described living on DHHL land illegally, maintaining it diligently despite being low on the waitlist, and called for an end to perceived corruption and more immediate allocation of land. They also mentioned issues with water in Honokaia.
6. Raised concerns about the Humu'ula land being overrun with gorse and criticized the Kawaihae brown/kuleana section, suggesting that DHHL should consult with the ranch nearby to determine the appropriate new designation for the area. They asked what actions would be taken to address these issues. In response, the commissioner discussed the possibility of utilizing

MEETING MINUTES

SUBJECT: Department of Hawaiian Homelands Hawai'i Island Plan Update Beneficiary

Meeting, Round 1 – Kohala and Hāmākua

August 14, 2024

Page 5

geothermal energy on Mauna Kea as a potential revenue source for DHHL, which could reduce reliance on state funding. While the idea of geothermal energy was presented as a possible solution, there was emphasis that DHHL would not proceed actions without thorough consultations with lessees and careful consideration of environmental impacts. The potential benefits of geothermal energy were noted, but further exploration and discussions are necessary.

This is our understanding of the topics discussed and the conclusions reached. Please give PBR HAWAII written notification of any errors or omissions within seven calendar days. Otherwise, this report will be deemed an accurate record and directive.

DEPARTMENT OF HAWAIIAN HOME LANDS
HAWAI'I ISLAND PLAN UPDATE
BENEFICIARY MEETING, ROUND 1 – HILO AND PUNA
AUGUST 6, 2024
ATTACHMENTS TO SUMMARY

**ATTACHMENT A:
PowerPoint Presentation**

DEPARTMENT OF HAWAIIAN HOME LANDS
HAWAI'I ISLAND PLAN UPDATE
BENEFICIARY MEETING, ROUND 1 – HILO AND PUNA
AUGUST 6, 2024
ATTACHMENTS TO SUMMARY

ATTACHMENT B:
Land Use Designation Updated Maps

DEPARTMENT OF HAWAIIAN HOME LANDS
HAWAI'I ISLAND PLAN UPDATE
BENEFICIARY MEETING, ROUND 1 – HILO AND PUNA
AUGUST 6, 2024
ATTACHMENTS TO SUMMARY

ATTACHMENT C:
Fact Sheet

DEPARTMENT OF HAWAIIAN HOME LANDS
HAWAI'I ISLAND PLAN UPDATE
BENEFICIARY MEETING, ROUND 1 – HILO AND PUNA
AUGUST 6, 2024
ATTACHMENTS TO SUMMARY

ATTACHMENT D:
Comment Cards