

MEETING NOTES

**Hawaiian Home Lands Beneficiary Consultation Meeting
On the 'Āina Mauna Legacy Program Humu'ula Game Management Pilot Project
Keaukaha Elementary School
Hilo, Hawai'i
July 5, 2013
6:00 pm to 7:30 pm**

Beneficiary Consultation Meeting Agenda

- I. Pule and Introductions
- II. Purpose of Beneficiary Consultation
- III. Presentation of Pilot Project
- IV. Open Discussion
- V. Next Steps and Closing

The following is a summary of the comments received during the “Open Discussion” that occurred during the meeting:

1. Is this project urgent because the sheep are encroaching on the Kaniho lease?
DHHL: No, the game management project is urgent because the sheep population is growing rapidly and we need to get it under control. Without any intervention, the sheep herd will grow exponentially.
2. Have you used shooting from helicopters to manage the sheep population?
DHHL: No, to date, we have not implemented any strategy to control the sheep population. If this game management pilot project is approved by the Commission, it will be the first strategy that DHHL has implemented to control the sheep population. DHHL would like to involve its beneficiaries in game management.
3. Are you going to charge a fee for hunting?
DHHL: For this initial pilot project, we do not intend to charge a fee for hunting.
4. The sheep, is it free? Can we go up there and go get it?
DHHL: The sheep are on Hawaiian Home Lands. So we have an opportunity to go get them. Currently, DHHL has a “no hunting” policy on its lands. DHHL is trying to assess this and engage communities in helping DHHL manage land and resources. DHHL felt that this section of Humu'ula is a good place to start, it is a contained area and there is an immediate need for more proactive management. If this game management project receives Commission approval, the successful implementation of this project could lead to other similar opportunities on other DHHL lands.
5. Are the sheep free, can we go grab one? Can we take it home?
DHHL: DHHL would prefer that people would not just go out there and grab one because we have a permitting system that allows you to go out on the lands; the permit is called a Limited Right of Entry Permit. Secondly, it could turn into anarchy real fast

because everyone would be up on the mountain just grabbing sheep without any monitoring, so the opportunity to make this a sustainable food resource could be lost without proper oversight of this resource. DHHL would like to have a clear plan and system to manage these resources.

6. It might be a good first step to give everyone an overview of what will happen before hunting even starts.

DHHL: The very first thing we must do is to reduce the size of the herd. DHHL would like to have a herd size around 350 sheep. The process for reducing the herd is first DHHL would get volunteers to help us set up traps. The sheep drive pretty easily. DHHL and volunteers would "rodeo" them into groups and the groups into the trap and sort them out. The volunteers will select the best sheep to keep and gradually reduce the herd to the appropriate size. The animals that we do not want will be killed on site. The meat will be taken home and the unusable parts of the animal will be buried. DOA permits are required in order for an individual to transport a live animal from one area to another. The permits are required for health and safety reasons. If the animal a person takes from Humu'ula is diseased and an outbreak occurs, DOH wants to be able to track the source of the disease. For that reason, DHHL initially does not want to allow live animals to be taken from the site.

7. Is this open to the public or only beneficiaries?

DHHL: That is one of the policy questions that DHHL staff would like to get feedback on from the participants at this meeting. Who do you think should be allowed to hunt?

8. The invitation letter that was sent out for this meeting said that this opportunity would be "a food source for the community". It is good that DHHL requires all people that hunt to complete safety classes and training, but now you talking "hunters", not only the homesteaders who are hunters, you get hunters all over the island. So my question is whether or not this area is for homesteaders, beneficiaries, or open to the public?
9. If hunting is open to everyone, who will stop the mainland people from coming to this area to hunt?
10. Is DHHL taking ownership of the sheep? The reason why the sheep are there now is because neighboring areas like Pohakuloa Training Area has had so much public pressure and desecration. Sheep went to DHHL areas because it is safe. DHHL wants to fence sheep in and get Hawaiians to kill them instead of the state killing them.

DHHL: Yes, DHHL views sheep on its property to be trust resources and assets to be managed for the benefit of its beneficiaries. You are correct, the reason why the sheep are currently on DHHL lands is because there is no hunting on DHHL lands and it is a safe haven for them. DHHL believes that the fencing is necessary because DHHL wants to make sure that it learns from this experience. If the animals get afraid because we are hunting them and they go to PTA or other neighboring areas, then we lose the opportunity to study them and improve the herd.

11. DHHL wants Hawaiians to do the dirty work of killing the sheep.
12. I like see this thing be pono. What I mean by "pono" is that the military is abusing all the access for their purpose, so the military's job should be to fix the herd for us. Not us. The military should help DHHL with animal issues. We the ones that should be making

decisions. We kanaka, we are a part of the state. The Supreme Court passed a bill on April 17th of this year. The Supreme Court said we kanaka are an independent nation and we can choose and govern ourselves. I been waiting over 30 years for my ag-lot. I was growing kalo, all different kinds and all different fruits and everything.

13. Who can hunt the sheep? There are a lot of people who have not been awarded homes. Not everyone can get homestead awards. I think it should be open to all Hawaiians, anyone with Hawaiian ancestry because that's who we are. It doesn't matter how much you have.

DHHL: DHHL wants to emphasize that this is a demonstration project, it will last two-three years at the most. After the initial period, DHHL will evaluate the project – identify what works and doesn't work in order to improve this project.

14. How long does it take to get on the list? My children and I may not qualify.

15. Tags may be a good method to keep and make funding for the project.

16. Education is important for the next generation(s) – currently teaching kids to hunt.

17. A lot of people here tonight may not understand who is a beneficiary and who is not. They do not know what's going on. Someone should explain what a DHHL beneficiary is.

DHHL: Beneficiaries as defined in the Hawaiian Homes Commission Act are native Hawaiians that have one-half (50%) Hawaiian ancestry or more and are at least 18 years old. If a beneficiary that meets the above requirement has received a homestead lease, the beneficiary can succeed that lease to a relative that is at least 25 percent Hawaiian blood. Those are beneficiaries that the trust was created for and DHHL has a fiduciary duty to administer this trust for the beneficiaries above and beyond non-beneficiaries.

18. What DHHL is trying to say is that it is DHHL's responsibility to take care of its beneficiaries first. All that land that is called Hawaiian Home Lands, DHHL has to take care of its beneficiaries first. Everybody else comes second. They have that responsibility.

Otherwise, if they don't do that, one of us beneficiaries can go after DHHL.

19. If the King was here on this 'āina and others were on the fence, where would the King be? Inside or outside the fence? He would be inside the fence and the others are supposed to be outside. This is ceded lands that was given by our King and our Queen. If the King is inside the fence, who from the outside goes in first? What would the king do? He would say, my people go in as much as can go in and get one kill. No questions asked. That's why DHHL today stands for the native Hawaiians. Hawaiian Home Lands stand for the native Hawaiian. Take care of the native Hawaiian. What about the others? None of us here are pure blooded Hawaiians. Everyone is mixed. We got to find one balance. If the King or Queen was here, the King would say that the first one that can come inside the fence would be the native Hawaiians because this is for them. Take care of the Hawaiians first. Ua mau ke ea o ka 'āina i ka pono. The life of the land is perpetuated in righteousness. The "life", I not talking about physical "life," the "life" comes from the King to us and then to the rest. Now we have the opportunity to move forward, not look back at the past. We got to move in the present, the now. We got to think big, so we can pono. Finally, pono is not only us but amongst our friends too.

20. I am a beneficiary. I have children who are not 50 percent. If you look at the perpetuity of the idea of 50 percent, the 50 percent might not be. Big Island land has been taken away by

conservationists and their fences. Those who are traditional customary practitioners cannot get on the land because of conservationists. In Ka'u, there is litigation going on for a conservationist fencing project. They are eradicating our sheep and other animals. Outside of DHHL, conservationists have eliminated hundreds and thousands of our food. Whose fault is it that the watershed is damaged? Not our pigs, it's development. DLNR is trying to amend its rules to try and make our pig injurious so that they can eradicate it. We receive our food from the mountain and the sea, but now we cannot get our food because of the conservationist. Pay attention Hawaiians! Conservationist are bringing seals to our ocean and kicking Hawaiians out! There's a seal hospital in Kona, but they cannot put one dialysis machine for Hawaiians there. They are taking away access. It is land acquisition. It is not taking care of our people. They are using you Hawaiians for eradication.

21. If there is no consent by the Commission to move forward with this project, are we just spinning our wheels? If we here tonight do not say "yes, we want this, we approve this" then we just shooting air. Prior to this meeting, has there been previous consent to get to this point?

DHHL: Yes, that is correct. DHHL has met with an advisory group for over a year to develop the project that we presented tonight.

22. If everyone has agreed that this is a "yes" and we want to move onto this project, what does DHHL see as resources that are needed to move it forward? It will take a lot of manpower to accomplish this. In the wa'a, it is not only two people paddling, it takes everyone. We only spin around in the ocean and it gets us nowhere. We need to be participants as well. I realize that there are so many larger issues out there, but we are talking about this project now. How are we as Hawaiians going to move this project forward? For example, are we going to commit two hours of service for this or volunteer on these sub-committees? These committees are helpless without people to support them. This is a project that will take continuous support. I am so proud of the people who decided to head these sub-committees. If the answer is "no" we don't want to do this, then we shouldn't be discussing this.

23. What if you are married to a DHHL beneficiary?

DHHL: An initial proposal by the advisory group with regards to the question of "who gets to hunt" was that hunting would be limited to DHHL beneficiaries, but beneficiaries would be able to take a guest of their choice. So the control of who gets to hunt remains with the beneficiary. If the beneficiary decides to share his/her opportunity to hunt with a non-beneficiary, then ultimately that choice belongs to the beneficiary. That is an option that was considered.

24. Let the youth be a part of this and let them guide the project.

25. All youth should have an opportunity to hunt and learn about sustainability.

26. We all Hawaiian. This is not the only area (Humu'ula) that people can hunt. We are talking about a small portion of land for this game management project. People can hunt in other areas.

27. DLNR has eradicated animals from other areas. Now we cannot hunt in other places. DLNR has pushed all the animals to Hawaiian Home Lands.

28. Aloha mai, I am one of the people on the advisory group. There were many many discussions like this tonight within the advisory group. My comment before I have to leave is that all the youth have the opportunity to learn how to hunt and about sustainability. This is not about eradication. It's about sustainability. It's about doing research to see how we can come to a balance, how many acres can sustain a sheep herd? We want to see the herds perpetuated into the future, not for us, but for the keiki. I want keiki to learn about hunting. In response to other comments made about opening up the area to everyone, the advisory group strongly suggested that beneficiaries come first, but that the beneficiary will be allowed to bring a guest. I can hunt, I am 50 percent. My son can hunt, he is 25 percent. But my nephew cannot, so I would want to invite him as my guest. The other thing to keep in mind too is that nothing is set in stone. The advisory group is only a small group. The beneficiaries are all a part of this too. We need to decide together. This is why these meetings are important so that we can receive all of the comments and figure out the direction we want to go, so everyone is in unison.

DHHL: DHHL is open to more volunteers helping on the advisory group. Get plenty work to do. We need people to step up. We can use all the help.

29. I am on the advisory committee. I support this project for several reasons. This project is not about "eradication". The scientists were told to eradicate because that's what their data told them to do. There's all this science that told them to do that. Maybe the scientists didn't look at all the options. Maybe through this project, we can show that we can live with animal, trees, and birds together. If we can show that this works, we can do this in other places as well.

30. Let the youth go and hunt. Why not have more kids involved?

DHHL: There is certainly an opportunity to involve more kids. DHHL and the advisory group suggested the age range between 10-17 because 10 is the legal age to be allowed to hunt in the state and 18 is when a person is eligible to be a beneficiary. There was also an idea to have a group of keiki that is supervised by one adult, but we were unsure if one adult would be able to safely watch all of the children. For now, we felt it would be safer to make it one keiki per adult. Maybe as this project evolves in the future, we can have larger groups of keiki hunting.

31. I have a 24 year old daughter who shows interest in hunting, but not with bow and arrow.

Will there be consideration for rifle hunting?

DHHL: In this particular hunting area, rifle hunting will not be allowed because this area is very close to Saddle Road. It would not be safe to hunt with rifles this close to the road. If DHHL opens other locations for hunting in the future, DHHL may consider rifle hunting on those lands if it is safe.

32. From what was presented, DHHL presented the upfront costs for this project, but DHHL did not present the cost of staffing and on-going operation expenses for each year. If the Commission approves this pilot project, will the project be funded by the Hawaiian Home fund?

DHHL: No, DHHL staff does not anticipate trust revenue being used because trust funds are very limited. The success of this project will be dependent upon donations and volunteers. The advisory group believes that this project will be very well received by

- various communities and will receive support from the communities in the form of donations and volunteers.
33. I recognize the benefit of this project. What happens if the Commission doesn't approve the project? What happens to the sheep then?
DHHL: The sheep population will continue to grow and eventually the sheep will over-run the mountain.
34. You need to check the fence lines. The fences are loose. The sheep will escape DHHL lands and go to DLNR lands and get eradicated.
35. When there were sheep, never had gorse. The sheep eat the baby gorse. I know because I have been hunting for over 20 years.
36. Don't leave the fate of this project to chance. We need to tell the Commission that we want to see this project move forward.
37. People will cut through fences.
38. The biologist promised us that there will be plenty areas to hunt. But it never did happen. They lied. They starting to put fencing projects all around Pohakuloa. The University of Colorado came down. They the ones that shoot all the sheep in the fenced areas. I hunt there many years, I know.
39. If this project is a go, and if you no like certain parts of this project, then you can join the advisory committee and voice your ideas for making it better. You can make a difference. Without a voice, you cannot make a difference. You have their phone number, if you have concerns, join the committee.
40. My son had an opportunity to learn about restoration. To our children, it's about food and culture. We need to teach our children the process of sustainability.
-

Write-in Comments Received:

41. I am the chair for the Hawaii Island Game Management Advisory Commission. We appreciate DHHL efforts to manage game on their lands. If we can help in any way please call.
42. Why can't I transfer my DHL selection status from Kauai to Hawai'i. (Not related to 'Āina Mauna Legacy Program!!)
43. Get revenues from our Access Road and telephone poles (utility); fair market rate. Hawai'i Island beneficiaries only for pilot program.
44. Everything should be very well thought out before any fence is erected or/and this thing is implemented.
45. Hawaiian hunters should be on the board to direct commission on hunting.
46. Willing to get involved – to teach and learn. Willing to help regulate hunts.
47. 1. I support this game management pilot program. 2. Will water be supplied for sheep during drought? 3. When you reduce the herd, if demand is less than supply, will access sheep be killed or could it [be] released onto public hunting land? 4. Could there be youth hunt season? 5. I support beneficiaries be allowed to bring siblings, spouse, and guests.

48. I support 'Āina Mauna Legacy Program. I would like the selection of hunters allowed to gather prioritized: beneficiaries, natives, then keiki. Mahalo.
49. I support the 'Āina Mauna Legacy Program.
50. No ways to business ventures. Fence off gorse and put sheep in. Control not eradicate.
51. I want this project to move forward.
52. I support this idea. Let's move forward with more planning. Let's help Hawaiians/Homesteaders create this sustainability project. When can we hunt?
53. I am interested in future meetings. I think that the hunting should be open to anyone of any amount of Hawaiian ancestry! Its DHHL has an amount set to hold land. The children are our future we need to teach them and they can incorporate this into our future...the adults could barely conduct their behaviors. Be "proactive" "think win, win". My mom owns Hawaiian Homes Land but I have 24% Hawaiian.
54. I am willing to help with restoration projects!! For sure; Hunting tags?? How many can we shoot? What type do we harvest? Males, how many females how many? Will hunting be seasonal or year round? When?? Reporting kills? Do we have seedlings or supplies of native forest species i.e. koa, kou, etc,?? Iliahi, manane, koko?? Yes, lets do it!! I will volunteer to help!! Let me know what I can do!! Suggested uses – low profile wind farm?? Kodiak Island Natives have 5 turbines that power the whole city of Kodiak!! 5 windmills. They cut down their dependency on fossil fuel 60%.
55. Will be willing to help.
56. At Mauna Kea, who own the sheep? Question answer. I am a property owner want to raise sheep if you let me even to have a vet check. P/S call or email.

LIST OF MEETING PARTICIPANTS FROM SIGN-IN SHEETS

(in alphabetical order by last name)

FIRST NAME, LAST NAME	CITY
Kala'i Aiona	Hilo
Michael Akau	Hilo
Steven Anahu	Hilo
Douglas K. Awai Sr.	Hilo
William Azwedo	Kuristown
Kawaiula Banner	Hilo
Gilbert Benavides	Hilo
Ricky J. Carvalho	Hilo
William U. Cho III	Hilo
Julia Cruz	Kea`au
Dylan Dedman	Did not identify city of residence
Deena DeMello	Hilo
Taylor DeReis	Hilo
Marc Farinas	Pahoa
Herk Freitas	Kuristown
Shon A. Galdeira	Mountain View
Danielle Haili	Hilo
Rourck Haili	Hilo
Representative Faye Hanohano	Pahoa
Charels K. Hanohano	Hilo
Charles Hanohano	Hilo
Leifi Hao	Hilo
Georgina Hashimoto	Pahoa
R. Haslam Jr.	Hilo
Charles Heakulani	Hilo
Lilinoe Haukulani	Hilo
Julie Hugo	Hilo
Mickey K. Ioane	Hilo
Myles Ioane	Hilo
Wallace Ishibashi	Hilo
Kaina Ito	Hilo
Shirene "Porsha" Jarneski	Hilo
Hawyn Susan Jeremiah	Hilo
Leslie K.J. Julian	Pahoa
Patrick I. Kahawaiolaa	Hilo
John Kanu	Hilo
Edwin Kanui	Hilo
Pono Kanui	Hilo
Charleston Kawae Jr.	Hilo
Manuel Kawaha	Hilo
Hiram Keliikoa	Hilo
Albert K. Kepano	Hilo
Gennie Kinney	Hilo

FIRST NAME, LAST NAME	CITY
Kiha W. Kinney	Hilo
Kealoha Kinney	Hilo
Eli Luke Kipilii	Hilo
Ronald T. Kodani	Hilo
Doreen Kodani	Hilo
Nora Kualii	Did not identify city of residence
Larry Kuamoo	Pahoa
Maikai Leanui	Hilo
Benedict LeeLoy	Hilo
John K. McBride	Hilo
Maudlyn Medeiros	Hilo
Jeff Melrose	Hilo
Edwin L.P. Miranda	Hilo
Troy Mokuhalii	Pahoa
Shanne Montibon	Hilo
Benjamin Naeana	Hilo
Keoki Namanu	Hilo
Marcus H. Nobriga Jr.	Volcano
Rennette Pacheco	Hilo
Larry Pacheco	Hilo
Shirley Pedro	Pahoa
G. Pugada	Kea`au
Donald Respicio	Hilo
Jason Sanborn	Hilo
Chad Sato	Hilo
Christina Sato	Hilo
Wayne Simonson	Volcano
Jesse Simonson	Volcano
Mele U. Spencer	Hilo
Tony Sylvester	Hilo
Kyle Takya	Hilo
Leonard Tanaka	Hilo
Valerie Tanimoto	Hilo
Clayton Tremaine IV	Hilo
Oli Tuvalde	Hilo
Annie Ua	Hilo
Sharon Vannatta	Hilo
Joe Veincent	Hilo
Kaikuahine W. Waialealee Jr.	Hilo
Andrew Warren	Kuristown
Sam Warren	Kuristown
Robert Yamada	Hilo
Alvin Yos	Hilo
Hunter	Hilo

Estimated number of meeting participants: **100-120**

Total number of participants that signed in: **87**

Number of participants that self-identified as DHHL beneficiaries on the sign-in sheet: **51**