

PLANNING OFFICE  
DEPARTMENT OF HAWAIIAN HOME LANDS

**Beneficiary Consultation**  
**Kalaupapa – NPS Preliminary Alternatives**

June 29, 2011  
Lanikeha Community Center  
6:00 p.m. - 8:00 p.m.

June 30, 2011  
Kulana 'Oiwi Complex  
9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.

**Attendance Sheets (June 29):** Kehau Tom, Kala'e Tangonan, Degray Vanderbilt, Abraham L. Maioho Jr., Anna Arakaki, Maggie Cassidy (Molokai Dispatch), Lori Buchanan, Esther Keohulua, Tuddie Purdy, E. Kealoha Patton, Rence Montizor, Walter Ritte, Vanalouise Montizor, Ochie Bush, Halona Kaopuiki, Noelani Kaulili, Whiston Kaulili, Kapoa Lauif, Maelynne Cruz, Vivian Ainoa, FernHamai, Katherien L. Coelho, Colette Y. Machado, Tess Mollena, Elroy Mollena

**DHHL :** Alapaki Nahale-a (Chairman), Henry K Tancayo (Moloka'i Commissioner), Darrell Yagodich (Planning Program Manager), Julie-Ann Cachola (Planner), Kaleo Manuel (Planner), Juliana Ka'upu (Moloka'i District Office)

**NPS:** Steve Prokop (Superintendent), Leslie Kanoa Nae'ole (Staff)

**Agenda:**

- A. Pule & Introductions
- B. Purpose of Meeting
- C. DHHL Background on Kalaupapa
- D. Presentation by Kalaupapa National Park Service
- E. Open Discussion of the Following Topics
  - i. Resources
  - ii. Visitor Experience
  - iii. Facilities
  - iv. Access & Transportation
  - v. Management, Partnerships & Agreements
  - vi. Boundary Modifications
- F. Open House

**Handouts:**

- 1) Agenda
- 2) NPS Newsletter #3 – Preliminary Alternatives
- 3) Kalaupapa NPS – Accomplishments & Initiatives

**A. Pule & Introductions**

The meeting was opened with a pule. Kaleo Manuel, planner with DHHL, introduced Henry Tancayo, Moloka'i Hawaiian Homes Commissioner, and Alapaki Nahale-a, Chairman of the Hawaiian Homes Commission. Chairman Nahale-a gave a brief introduction to the group and explained that he was at the meeting to listen and get input from beneficiaries. Kaleo continued by introducing other DHHL staff as well as Kalaupapa National Park's Superintendent, Steve Prokop.

**B. Purpose of Meeting**

"To get input and feedback on Preliminary Alternatives as identified by Kalaupapa National Park Service."

**C. DHHL Background on Kalaupapa**

To put the meeting into context, Kaleo gave an overview of the Moloka'i Island Plan that specifically talks about the proposed land uses at Kalaupapa and Pala'au, most of which has Special District and Conservation land use designations. Both designations require specialized and detailed planning in order to consider severe development constraints, as well as natural and cultural resources.

Currently, the department's 1,247 acres in Kalaupapa is primarily located in the settlement area and is general leased to the National Park Service for \$230,000 a year until 2041.

Various opportunities and constraints exist in Kalaupapa that include:

- Perpetuating the legacy of Kalaupapa
- Protecting significant cultural and natural resources
- Recognizing the impact of canonization of Father Damien & beatification of Mother Marian Cope
- NPS interest in long term perpetuation of area
- Limited access by trail, plane, and barge
- Expensive maintenance, improvement, and new development costs

In previous beneficiary meetings held by the department, in both the Moloka'i Island Plan and Moloka'i Regional Plan processes, there were various community concerns or comments related to Kalaupapa:

*Island Plan*

- Preserve legacy
- Respect patients
- Only for education
- Teach old ways
- NPS work with Native Hawaiians

*Regional Plan*

- DHHL engage with NPS in planning
- Ensure gathering
- Pala'au separate from Kalaupapa
- Ag homesteading
- Consult with beneficiaries

D. Presentation by Kalaupapa National Park Service

Steve Prokop, Superintendent at Kalaupapa National Park, briefly reviewed the General Management Plan process and the Preliminary Alternatives proposed in the NPS Newsletter #3 (See handout). In addition, he also provided some history and background of the National Park Service at Kalaupapa since its establishment in 1980 and ended by highlighting some of their accomplishments and initiatives in 2010.

E. Open Discussion

After the presentations by DHHL and NPS, the meeting was opened up for discussion and to gather mana'o. The table below highlights the comments and questions given by those in attendance at the meeting and any response that may have been provided.

<b>Subject</b>	<b>Question/Comment/Suggestion</b>	<b>Response/Key Point</b>
Planning	Didn't know NPS was going to be here	
Planning	KHNP/DLNR – long range plans suck	
Planning	The no action/tourist alternative = carrying capacity; No accommodations or shared governance, just tourist	
Planning	Since 1992 NPS has had jurisdiction but has no plan (partially due to DOH patients there)	
Planning	Want map for No alternatives	
Planning	Watch for blue color – this changes from map to map	
Planning	The use should not guide the plan	
Planning	Colors disappear from map to map. Why? Are cultural sites not important?	
Planning	I want an Alternative F – we make our own alternative plan	MAKE OUR OWN ALTERNATIVE F
Planning	We want to be proactive – create a task force	
Planning	GMP planning is arbitrary and capricious	
Homesteading	Is homesteading planned?	
Homesteading	Opening for homestead?	OPEN UP TO HOMESTEADING
Homesteading	About 5 years ago we discussed homesteading – but if open up we have to open up to all	CAUTION – HOMESTEADING WOULD OPEN KALAUPAPA UP TO ALL

<b>Subject</b>	<b>Question/Comment/Suggestion</b>	<b>Response/Key Point</b>
Homesteading	Homesteading? Waikolu and Waihanau – get water	HOMESTEAD ADJACENT VALLEYS
Homesteading	What is the purpose of homesteading at Kalaupapa? To live off the land? What are you going to do there? And is National Park still going to be there?	WHAT PURPOSE WOULD HOMESTEADING SERVE
Homesteading	Lighthouse – Coast Guard had a fence to separate – we have ancestors there – spirits are alive so leave them alone; keep like Punchbowl cemetery – monument – no need homesteading because we already have up here	MANY BURIALS IN KALAUPAPA
Management	Ownership of Peninsula – DHHL got the short end – part of land missing; DHHL had the whole peninsula and not just the ahupua’a	We have report on land ownership. It was part of the claims process in 1995 and legislative settlement.
Management	Who claimed other 2 ahupua’a?	State DLNR
Management	Is there any balance of lands owed to DHHL?	No
Management	Need repair money	COST TO REPAIR IMPROVEMENTS
Management	DOH – give holding to DHHL – get DOI to waive payments	
Management	Kalawao County vs. Maui? – so county rules apply	MAINTAIN KALAWAO AS SEPARATE, INDEPENDENT COUNTY
Management	Work with DOI to waive fees – associated with infrastructure development if we were to break lease	TERMINATE LEASE WITH DOI TURNING OVER IMPROVEMENTS TO DHHL
Management	With Father Damien – everyone came wanting to get in on the money	
Management	Audit – how much NPS money was approved by HHC for improvements to Kalaupapa?	
Management	Work with secretary of Dept of Interior to waive cost if we were	

Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
	to break lease	
Management	NPS has MOUs with everyone	
Management	Pg 4. – management structure: long term – NPS assumes authority over resources	
Management	Kalawao County – DOH runs; when last patient dies DOH will be out...Alternative being proposed is to be absorbed into Maui County; all rules/regs will apply – SMA planning dept.	
Management	Options – Kalawao absorbed into “Molokai County” or Molokai absorbed into Kalawao County/Kalaupapa where we make our own rules	
Management	Long term resource management – Molokai Police Dept. would be rangers – not comfortable with this	
Management	What do you want them to do for us? =1 year notice to vacate; more facilities; if they terminate lease, then we have to pay for improvements – say STOP to improvements because DHHL can’t pay back; DOH give buildings to DHHL; DHHL take over management	
Management	We become Kalawao County	
Management	Suggestion: Create joint DHHL/OHA Kalaupapa Task Force – to work out details for an agreement between DHHL/OHA/NPS	
Management	Suggestion: a) DHHL keep control over land b) short term lease, high rent c) Keep Kalaupapa as health facility for rehabilitation, kupuna assisted living, since facilities already exist	DHHL SHOULD KEEP CONTROL OVER LAND  HEALTH CARE FACILITY

Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
Management	Protect the legacy of place – I hope you hear it	PROTECT KALAUPAPA LEGACY
Management	Pala’au Park – every time go up to Park it’s ugly – church leans it up – get donations – go back and people destroy again; how are you going to take care of it? I teach my kids to take care of the land – it’s not about money, it’s because we love it there – do for free; step up and take care	
Management	Community Use/management – teach kids	
Lease	Lease funds – DHHL receives from NPS; how important is the lease rent to DHHL operations	Come July 2011, \$230,000/year lease rent; does not include maintenance and development costs of area Money goes to big pot – HHC allocates (some in Molokai, some financing- reserves) for loans and operations
Lease	Lease Rent - \$230,000/yr paid to who?	NPS pays to DHHL
Lease	Lease – says \$325,000/yr; what happened?	
Lease	Lease – lump sum of \$1 million there after and redetermine fee every 5 years	General Lease determines re-negotiation terms and amounts by appraisal
Lease	Suggestion: Cancel/keep lease: Audit on how much money NPS has invested in Kalaupapa to determine how much DHHL would owe.	
Lease	Land lease to NPS, DLNR – Poor stewards	
Lease	Current and Future Lease Agreements – what are they? Explain “special provision” #6a & #6b?	
Lease	NPS Lease agreements/MOUS a) DOH – 2024? b) DOT – c) DHHL – 2041, 1300 acres	
Lease	Pala’au – leased to DLNR for	

Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
	\$900/yr; 4 stalls reserved for Native Hawaiian concessions; who knew? Check the lease	
Lease	Up to now – everyone with DHHL lease did poor job at managing	
Lease	Lease – want DHHL to be transparent	
Lease	Lease - Special Provision #6 – explain it	
Lease	Can we stop lease agreement just approved by HHC (Pala’au)?	
Lease	Is the lease extended as long as patients are alive?	Leases have set end dates
Lease	Would you consider year to year lease? In near term?	NPS: Our employees want job security. Long term lease supports investment in the property and use.
Lease	Why settle for year to year if put increase money in?	
Lease	Why give long lease if we are going to take it back?	
Boundaries	Extension of boundaries – this shouldn’t be part of discussion; the focus should be on DHHL lands	
Resources	National Historic Landmark	2 designations – National Natural Landmark (cliffs) & National Historic Landmark (Kalaupapa settlement) Protection is recognized nationwide
Resources	So already have designation?	Yes
Resources	No one is teaching respect for historic and cultural sites	
Resources	Traditional gathering is restrictive under the GMP – you are a visitor and abide by all rules as all – not special	RECOGNIZE TRADITIONAL GATHERING RIGHTS
Resources	Before –taking and use our land without compensation	
Resources	Who is going to tell the stories? The children?	DOCUMENT KALAUPAPA STORIES & HISTORY



Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
Resources	Where are the interviews? Do we have access to those interviews?	
Resources	The stories need to be told....who?	
Resources	I can share my stories	
Resources	950 marked graves and thousands of unmarked graves	MANY BURIALS AT KALAUPAPA
Resources	Research project – cultural use study of natural resources; spirituality – culturally special place to Native Hawaiians	SIGNIFICANT CULTURAL PLACE
Facilities	Stop/moratorium on building approvals on lease lands “The Money Pit”	
Access	It’s our right to access	RECOGNIZE TRADITIONAL GATHERING RIGHTS
Access	Access – have a right to go down trail but was told by park rangers – NO	
Native Hawaiian	No mention of Native Hawaiians for community in plan – only “visitors”	NEED TO RECOGNIZE NATIVE HAWAIIANS IN NPS PLAN
Native Hawaiian	Native Hawaiians have been left out of the process; no protocol; stewardship needs to include this	
Native Hawaiian	What did kuleana tenants get when they were forced to leave Kalaupapa?	In 1865, the Legislative Assembly passed “An Act to Prevent the Spread of Leprosy” and authorized to acquire land in northern Molokai. The Kingdom of Hawaii acquired the private lands at Kalawao in 1865, Makanalua in 1866, Kalaupapa in 1873, and Waikolu in 1909.
Native Hawaiian	Carrot of concessions – Pg. 2; for non-profit organizations and for Native Hawaiian individuals; on soft \$/grants and few have long term goals	
Native Hawaiian	Trust Obligation – set aside lands to rehabilitate Native Hawaiians	TRUST OBLIGATION TO REHABILITATE NATIVE HAWAIIANS
Native Hawaiian	Evictions – Native Hawaiians were evicted from Kalaupapa for	Kalaupapa acquired by Kingdom of Hawaii in 1873.

Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
	settlement of Hanson's Disease Patients	
Native Hawaiian	We've had no rights down there with NPS and DOH; it's not clean; we need DHHL to represent us	DHHL REPRESENTS NATIVE HAWAIIAN RIGHTS IN KALAUPAPA
Native Hawaiian	We want to preserve Kalaupapa - my 'ohana are the Kalaukoas	PRESERVE KALAUPAPA
Native Hawaiian	DHHL - you represent Hawaiian People; make decisions that for the benefit of beneficiaries	
Visitor Experience	1970's I went to Kalaupapa - Serenity a) don't rush patients; leave them alone b) make like school project - can teach kids to go down	SERENITY OF KALAUPAPA
ALL	OHA/DHHL should look at what we are paying for general public; not getting due compensation a) homesteading b) access to resources c) use of existing infrastructure and resources d) joint management now - DHHL can't do it on it's own e) provide management level job opportunities f) Governance of Kalawao g) Use of Pala'au State Park h) Acquisition of Waikolu Valley from DLNR	
Other	Waihanau - give back to Meyers	
Other	Protective of patients	
Other	Is there a website we can get Lori Buchanan's information?	DHHL website - will post minutes, lease, and additional information
Other	Can we get access to what other islands saying at meetings?	
Other	Newspaper has NPS website that has all comments received	
Other	Education is important - where is it in Molokai?	
Other	Patients can't see much -	

Subject	Question/Comment/Suggestion	Response/Key Point
	favoritism	
Other	Thank you for beneficiary only session	
Other	President of Ka ‘Ohana o Kalaupapa couldn’t make meeting – has 28 page position paper – been working with NPS	
Other	KS 5 <sup>th</sup> graders did play on Kalaupapa	
Other	Very special	
Other	Need to experience Kalaupapa with patients still alive	

The meeting was closed and those in attendance were reminded about another opportunity to provide comments and mana‘o on the following day at the open house at Kulana ‘Oiwī.

*June 30, 2011*  
**Kulana ‘Oiwi Complex**  
**9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.**

F. Open House

**Attendance Sheets (June 30):** Iwalani Arakaki, Eliza K. Po’aha Reyes, Jessie L. Pe’elua-Wallace, Beverly Pau’ole-Moore, Sybil Lopez, April Maddera, Justin Avelino, Kamalani Pali

The open house format allows DHHL staff to engage one on one with beneficiaries and community members to get comments and feedback. In addition, all of the notes from the previous night were posted to show what was discussed the night before and to help facilitate discussion on issues related to Kalaupapa.

The table below details some key comments that beneficiaries provided at the open house meeting:

<b>Question/Comment/Suggestion</b>
Iwalani Arakaki: Give ‘ohana from Kalaupapa the chance to give mana’o; not my place to tell them what to do with Kalaupapa, I’m not from there
Kupuna Reyes (pure Hawaiian) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Hawaiians should be at the forefront</li> <li>b) Access – what’s going to happen to us locals and Hawaiians? Stop us? Treat us like po’e haole – NO!</li> <li>c) Po’oha and Kapi’ioho are the ‘ohana from there before lepers</li> <li>d) Kalaupapa is a spiritual place</li> <li>e) No resort</li> <li>f) NPS needs to be guided by our culture and our family</li> <li>g) I like more of Alternative B</li> <li>h) Reconnect with place</li> <li>i) Born and raised there so I have a right</li> <li>j) I don’t want to minamina that place</li> <li>k) I love my people! I have values, don’t hana ‘ino</li> <li>l) No homesteading – leave as is; main thing get someone take care of place</li> </ul>
Stacy Crivello <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) NPS going to drive it at this point</li> <li>b) Patients can and should make decisions</li> <li>c) Community gatekeeper – need check and balance</li> <li>d) More transparency from NPS</li> </ul>
Aunty Bev: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) We love Kalaupapa</li> </ul>

*\*\*The deadline to provide comment is July 30, 2011*